

Chapter 4 Findings.

4.1 introduction.

This chapter presents the data gathered regarding students' values of assessment and evaluation methods and provides an analysis of the research findings. This has been grouped according to the methods of data collection; the self-evaluation sheet, researcher observations during class activities and the final evaluation sheet on assessment methods.

4.2 Self-evaluation sheet

The initial evaluation sheet intended to observe student's ability to isolate the success criteria of the marking scheme discussed in lesson one of the Unit of Learning and their ability to recognise their skill in these areas. After completing a drawing with each of the four drawing methods (See Appendices X for full figures of drawings), students were asked to pick which drawing was most successful for each heading of the marking scheme.

| What four headings is the life drawing leaving cert assessed under? Explain them in your own words, for yourself. Which drawing method featured this the strongest? Overall which method helped you produce the strongest drawing (Closest to the marking scheme)? | | | | | |
|--|-----------------|-----------------------------|------------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Participant | Composition | Proportion | Tone/Line | Form/Volume | Overall |
| 1 | Counting heads✓ | N/A | Continuous line✗ Skeleton | Skeleton✓ | Counting heads✓ |
| 2 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A |
| 3 | Skeleton✓ | Counting heads✓ | Skeleton✓ | Continuous Line✗ Skeleton | Skeleton✓ |
| 4 | Counting heads✓ | Shapes✗ Skeleton | Continuous Line✗ Skeleton | Skeleton✓ | Skeleton✓ |
| 5 | Skeleton✓ | Skeleton✓ | Continuous line✓ | Skeleton✓ | Skeleton✓ |
| 6 | N/A | Counting heads✗ Skeleton | Counting heads✗ Skeleton | Counting heads✗ Skeleton | Counting heads & Skeleton✓ |
| 7 | Counting heads✓ | Counting heads✓ | Skeleton✓ | Skeleton✓ | Counting heads✓ |

Green✓ = Corresponds with teachers' assessment.

Red✗ = Does not correspond with teacher's assessment.

The teacher later assessed each drawing against the marking scheme to see if the students' choices corresponded to the teacher's professional assessment using the leaving cert marking scheme. Indicated in green in the above table is where student choice corresponded to teacher's assessment. Red indicates where it did not correspond, with text in red signifying which drawing they achieved highest marks in for that category.

Two students self-evaluations corresponded with the teachers assessment in all four categories, one student corresponded in three out of four, two students were in line with the teacher's assessment in two out of four headings and one student's evaluation did not coincide with the teacher's assessment in any category of the marking scheme. All seven students' choice of overall most successful drawing was in line with the teacher's assessment of the drawings.

4.3 researcher observations during class.

During the study, some findings arose as observations by the researcher, recorded through the transcripts of audio recordings of the classes (See appendices X) and post class reflections by the researcher (see appendices X). Student participation in discussion was analysed by counting each input and translating individual total of inputs into percentages of total inputs from all students.

| Participant | Percentage of the total discussion contributed by each participant individually. |
|-------------|--|
| 1 | 6% |
| 2 | 2% Note: partly absent for two lessons. |
| 3 | 37% Note: Absent for final lesson. |
| 4 | 7% |
| 5 | 4% |
| 6 | 19% |
| 7 | 24% |

These inputs were further analysed under the themes of student interest in assessment methods and indication of student learning to express the how much of their input in class expressed these themes.

| Participant | % indicating their learning | % expressing interest in assessment methods |
|-------------|-----------------------------|---|
| 1 | 0% | 0% |
| 2 | 0% | 25% |
| 3 | 3.75% | 5% |
| 4 | 0% | 0% |
| 5 | 25% | 12.5% |
| 6 | 2.4% | 0% |
| 7 | 17% | 12% |

A final observation regarded student's willingness to grade each drawing. Students were asked to grade each drawing according to the marking scheme after each drawing. Students were reluctant to engage with this process.

In the first drawing, Two (28%) students gave marks of 4 under composition only, one (14%) student wrote the comments 'Person is too small on page' and 'Too much negative space' but no marks, one (14%) student wrote the comment 'More in the centre' but no marks and three (42%) students gave no marks or comments at all. No student wrote marks or comments for drawings two, three, four or five. For drawing six, after the group critique exercise, each student gave a mark out of five for each category in the marking scheme, except for one student who was absent for the class.

| Participant | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |
|-------------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Drawing 1 | x | ✓ | ✓ | x | x | ✓ | ✓ |
| Drawing 2 | x | x | x | x | x | x | x |
| Drawing 3 | x | x | x | x | x | x | x |
| Drawing 4 | x | x | x | x | x | x | x |
| Drawing 5 | x | x | x | x | x | x | x |
| Drawing 6 | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |

Completion of self-grading after each drawing.

| Student/Teacher Assessment of drawing six according to leaving cert marking scheme. | | | | | |
|---|-------------|------------|-----------|-------------|-----------------|
| Participant | Composition | Proportion | Tone/Line | Form/Volume | Overall |
| 1 | 5 / 4 | 3 / 2 | 4 / 2 | 2 / 2 | 14=70% / 10=50% |

| | | | | | |
|---|-------|-------|-------|-------|-----------------|
| 2 | 4 / 4 | 4 / 3 | 2 / 2 | 3 / 3 | 13=65% / 12=60% |
| 3 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | Absent |
| 4 | 3 / 4 | 3 / 3 | 3 / 3 | 4 / 3 | 11=55% / 13=65% |
| 5 | 4 / 5 | 3 / 4 | 4 / 4 | 3 / 4 | 14=70% / 17=85% |
| 6 | 2 / 4 | 3 / 2 | 1 / 2 | 1 / 2 | 7=35% / 10=50% |
| 7 | 4 / 4 | 3 / 4 | 4 / 4 | 3 / 4 | 14=70% / 16=80% |

4.4 Final evaluation sheet

The second evaluation sheet was divided into three sections for analysis, questions prompting personal response, statements with a scale of agreement and recording which evaluation methods students would use in the future from a list of tasks.

When asked about students' prior knowledge about the success criteria as laid down by the marking scheme (Question 1) three students (43%) said no, two (29%) said yes, one student (14%) had 'some idea' and one (14%) did not answer.

| Participant | Q1. Did you know you what you had to draw for the life drawing exam before looking at the marking scheme? (did you have an idea of what a good drawing should be?) |
|-------------|--|
| 1 | Yes. |
| 2 | Some idea. |
| 3 | No. |
| 4 | Yes. |
| 5 | No. |
| 6 | No. |
| 7 | Not answered. |

All seven (100% of) students indicated that they felt it was important to understand the marking scheme (Question 2). Two students (29%) claimed they knew what to focus on as a result. The same two students (29%) indicated it helped their time management in the life drawing exercises. Four (57%) other students claimed they 'knew what to do' after analysing the marking scheme. The seventh student (14%) claimed it helped them 'achieve the whole points' and it helped them 'have a good drawing'. Only four of the seven students (57%) mentioned marks or points.

| Participant | Q2. Why is it important to understand the marking scheme? What does this help us do? |
|-------------|---|
| 1 | Because it helps us to know what our drawings should have. |
| 2 | It helps us prioritise which features of a life drawing we should focus on in the leaving cert and how to manage our time. |
| 3 | So it allows us to know what to do when drawing and what is important. |
| 4 | Because it helps you to achieve the whole points in your drawing and it also help you to have a good drawing. |
| 5 | I can draw it careful like what do we need to draw for getting mark. |
| 6 | So it shows us what we need to do to mark off. |
| 7 | Because it helps us realise what we should focus on and how we can get extra marks for doing simple things like drawing the feet, instead of wasting time on less important things. |

All seven (100% of) students responded positively when asked how in control they were of their ability to improve after studying the marking scheme (Question 3). Five of the seven (71%) students indicated it gave them a sense of clarity on what to focus on in their life drawing, with one (14%) student specifying this would give 'more direction when practicing' and another one (14%) student specifically mentioning line as something to focus on. One (14%) student felt they were more in control of their ability to improve as they felt they had 'improved so much from the beginning'. Only one (14%) student mentioned marks, indicating; 'I can understand how I can get more marks' put them more in control of their ability to improve.

| Participant | Q3. How in control of your ability to improve do you feel after studying the marking scheme? |
|-------------|--|
| 1 | Good, better, that I have improve so much from the beginning. |
| 2 | I felt that, after looking at the marking scheme, I had more direction when practicing and working on my life drawing. |
| 3 | Very, as I know what to prioritise when drawing. |
| 4 | I feel that I have the ability to improve now, because I've a clearer idea of what should I focus on. |
| 5 | It's going to look good and I understand what is the point of drawing. |
| 6 | Yes because I can understand how I can get more marks. |
| 7 | I feel a lot more in control and I know what I should be doing and what to focus on and what to include, like marking in lighter lines and darker lines. |

Proportion was universally considered to have improved over the course of the Unit of Learning by all seven (100%) students (Question 4). Composition was considered to have improved in four (57%) response, tone in two (28%), Line in three (42%) and form/volume in two (28%). Proportion was specifically mentioned in six (85%) responses while two (28%) considered all areas (Proportion, Composition, Tone/Line, Form/Volume) to have improved. One of these responses claimed that 'especially proportion and tone' had improved and the other 'wasn't that advanced in art' prior to the Unit of Learning. Two responses (28%) specified both composition and proportion and one (14%) of these specified that line had improved.

| Participant | Q4. In what areas did you feel your drawing improved over the week? (Proportion, composition, Tone/Line, Form/Volume) |
|-------------|---|
| 1 | Proportion. |
| 2 | Composition, proportion and line. |
| 3 | Proportion. |
| 4 | Proportion and composition. |
| 5 | Proportion. |
| 6 | All of them because I wasn't that advanced in art. |
| 7 | All of them especially proportion and tone.t |

Three (42%) students indicated they were more comfortable speaking about and marking their own work (Question 5). Three (42%) students claimed to be more comfortable doing so with other students work, while one (14%) didn't specify.

| Participant | Q5. Were you more comfortable speaking about and grading your own work or grading another student's work? |
|-------------|---|
| 1 | Of my own work. |

| | |
|---|---|
| 2 | I was more comfortable grading someone else's work because I knew I could be objective and fair. |
| 3 | Speaking and grading my own work. |
| 4 | My own work. |
| 5 | Yes. |
| 6 | Other people's work. |
| 7 | I liked looking and reviewing other peoples work. I also liked hearing feedback because everyone sees things differently. |

Six of seven (85%) students indicated that discussing either their work or others work in the group critique exercise helped make the life drawing tasks clearer (Question 6). One specified that it suited their methodical mindset. One student did not answer the question.

| Participant | Q6. How did this evaluation method make the task clearer to you or help you understand what you had to do? |
|-------------|---|
| 1 | Not answered. |
| 2 | When looking at someone else's work I could recognise what they did differently from me, where they scored higher and where they scored lower, and it helped me evaluate my own work. |
| 3 | Knew what to look for. |
| 4 | Because im really methodic, so it actually helps me a lot. |
| 5 | We can understand what we need. Then we can practice the points and fix them. |
| 6 | Because the tasks were really straight forward. |
| 7 | Because my looking at work you like to realise what you need to improve on. You also know what not to do or what to avoid. |

Five out of seven students (71%) indicated they found it easier to give themselves a mark while in a group and two (28%) found it easier to give themselves a mark by themselves (Question 7). Two of the three the students that indicated a preference to discussing their own work in question 5 recorded they found it easier to mark themselves in a group in question 7, while one student preferred marking their own work by themselves. Two of three students who would prefer to evaluate other people's work indicated they found it easier to give themselves a mark in a group. One of students who would prefer to evaluate other people's work responded to have found giving themselves a mark by themselves to be easier.

| Participant | Q7. Did you find it easier to give yourself a mark by yourself or when in a group? |
|-------------|--|
| 1 | By myself. |
| 2 | In a group. |
| 3 | In a group. |
| 4 | In a group. |
| 5 | In a group. |
| 6 | Myself. |
| 7 | In a group. |

The second part of the final evaluation sheet consisted of a Likert scale of one to five, where 1 equalled do not agree and five equalled strongly agree, to a series of statements.

| Participant | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | AVG. |
|-------------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|------|
|-------------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|------|

| | | | | | | | | |
|---|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|------|
| Reading the marking scheme helped me realise what I had to do | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| Defining the success criteria myself helped me realise what I'm aiming for | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 4.42 |
| I found it easy to give myself a grade | 4 | 3 | 2 | 5 | 3 | 1 | 2 | 2.85 |
| Grading my own work after each exercise helped my work improve | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4.57 |
| Hearing my peers talk about my work made it easier to see where I needed to improve | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 1 | 5 | 4.14 |
| I was very comfortable having others talk about my work | 3 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 4 | 3.14 |
| I was very comfortable talking about my work with the teacher | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 5 | 4 |
| Filling out a worksheet helped me figure out which methods I prefer to work with | 4 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3.2 |
| Total/40 | 35 | 33 | 31 | 36 | 29 | 23 | 33 | |

All seven (100%) students indicated a strong agreement that reading the marking scheme helped them realise what they had to do. Four (57%) students indicated they strongly agree that defining success criteria themselves helped make their aims clear, three (42%) agreed and one (14%) was indifferent. One (14%) student disagreed with finding it easy to give themselves a grade, two (28%) somewhat disagreed, two (28%) were indifferent, one (14%) agreed and one (14%) strongly agreed. Three (42%) students indicated they agreed that grading themselves after each exercise helped their work improve and four (57%) strongly agreed. Two (28%) students considered having peers discuss their work helped them see the areas they needed to improve, four (42%) strongly agreed with this, and one (14%) disagreed. Regarding if students were comfortable having others talk about their work, one (14%) student disagreed, one (14%) student somewhat disagreed, two (28%) were indifferent, two (28%) agreed and one (14%) strongly agreed. Three (42%) students strongly agreed with being comfortable talking about their work with their teacher, two (28%) agreed, one (14%) was indifferent and one (14%) somewhat disagreed. In response to whether filling out a worksheet assisted in which method to work with; four (57%) agreed, one (14%) was indifferent and two (28%) somewhat disagreed.

To conclude the final evaluation sheet students were asked to indicate with a tick what methods of evaluation they would use in future.

| | Participant | | | | | | | |
|---|--------------------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|---|
| | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | |
| Defining success criteria before hand | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | 6 |
| Beginning with many techniques/approaches | ✓ | | | | | | ✓ | 2 |
| Writing my own marks/feedback as I go | ✓ | | | ✓ | | ✓ | | 3 |
| Asking a friend/teacher for advice | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | | | ✓ | 5 |
| Swapping with a friend to mark our work | | | | | | | | 0 |
| Discuss work in a group | | ✓ | | ✓ | | ✓ | ✓ | 4 |
| Mark work together in a group | | ✓ | | ✓ | | | | 2 |

| | | | | | | | | |
|--|---|----|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Personal reflection by myself | ✓ | ✓ | | | ✓ | | | 3 |
| Answering pre-set questions about the process (Evaluation sheet) | ✓ | | | | | ✓ | | 2 |
| Displaying my work for others to see | | ✓ | | | | | | 1 |
| Observing work that wasn't successful | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | | | ✓ | 5 |
| Analysing what my favourite piece of work is and why | ✓ | ✓ | | ✓ | | ✓ | | 4 |
| Redoing processes that have worked well for me previously | | ✓ | ✓ | | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | 5 |
| Looking at other work considered to be successful | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | 6 |
| | 9 | 10 | 5 | 6 | 4 | 7 | 7 | |

Six (85%) would define success criteria prior to starting another project. Two (28%) would begin with multiple techniques or approaches. Three (42%) would give themselves marks and/or feedback as they progress. Five (71%) would ask their teacher and/or a friend for help. No student would swap work with a friend to mark. Four (57%) would discuss work in group. Three (42%) would reflect by themselves. Two (28%) would use evaluation sheets. One (14%) would display their work for others. Five (71%) would like to see examples of unsuccessful work. Four (57%) would analyse what their favourite piece of work is and why as an evaluation method. Five (71%) would redo what has worked for them in the past and six (85%) would like to see examples of successful work.

'Defining success criteria beforehand' and looking at 'examples of successful work' were the most common methods that would be repeated, while 'Swapping with a friend to mark our work' had the least interest followed by 'Displaying my work for others to see'. Participant 2 had the broadest range of interests in methods while participant 4 had the narrowest range.

4.5 Summary of findings

The findings emerging from the data illustrate student preferences for either individual or group evaluation. It has been observed that most students can perform in both types of exercises, but some had preference for one over the other. Seemingly, the most accurate method of self-assessment was the individual gradeless evaluation sheet. While the response to the group discussion was mixed, all students found it beneficial towards future self-evaluation as willingness to self-assess increased seemingly after this group critique activity. The data suggests that students found discussing Success criteria beforehand and clearly understanding them, redoing processes that worked, discussing work together and marking their own work to be valuable assessment and evaluation tools. These findings will be discussed in greater detail and their relevance to current research literature in the next chapter.